

LEVEL OF SOME HEAVY METALS IN SELECTED FRUITS AND VEGETABLES

S. T. Garba^{1*}, B. U. Mustapha² and A. Baba¹

¹(Department of Chemistry, P. M. B. 1069. University of Maiduguri, Borno State, Nigeria
stelagarba@yahoo.com and babslega@gmail.com

²(Department of Science and Laboratory Technology, Ramat Polytechic, Maiduguri, Borno State, Nigeria
babaumar955@gmail.com

*Corresponding author

Email Address: stelagarba@yahoo.com, Phone +234 070 3035 2060

ABSTRACT

This paper is aimed at assessing the level of the heavy metals: Lead (Pb), Arsenic (As), Cadmium (Cd), Chromium (Cr), Selenium (Se), Zinc (Zn) and Nickel (Ni) in some fruits and vegetables grown in Gongolon irrigation site, Jere local government area of Borno state. Bunches of soil, fruits and vegetables samples (lettuce, water-melon, cucumber, tomato, guava, onion and sorrel) were collected from the site. Prepared samples were digested using freshly prepared aqua regia (HNO₃ + HCl) in the ratio 1:3. Analysis of the samples was done using Atomic Absorption Spectroscopy (AAS). The result obtained shows that, the level of arsenic ranged from 0.018µg/g in onion to 0.038µg/g in lettuce. Cadmium had 0.107µg/g in sorrel, 0.630µg/g in tomato, 0.440µg/g in lettuce and 0.700µg/g in cucumber. The element (As) was not detected in guava, watermelon, onion and even the soil that support their growth. The levels; 0.571, 0.508, 0.275 and 0.073µg/g Chromium, were detected in tomato, onion, lettuce and sorrel respectively for Cr. The element was however not detected in cucumber, guava and watermelon. High level of Nickel (Ni) was found in onion (0.365µg/g) followed by tomato (0.351µg/g) and lettuce (0.275µg/g). Nickel was not detected in cucumber, guava, watermelon and sorrel. Lead (Pb) was only detected in tomato (0.150µg/g) and onion (0.141µg/g). Zinc Zn) was observed in all the vegetables and fruits, the level of which ranged from 0.719µg/g in onion to 2.202µg/g in tomato. Also selenium (Se) was observed in all the samples, the level ranged from 0.326µg/g in watermelon to 0.653µg/g in lettuce. The variation in the level of the elements in the fruits and vegetable could be attributed mostly to atmospheric deposition and the variety of the fruits or vegetable. Most fruits with hard pericarp had less level of the metals, the source of which therefore could be the soil. Those with soft pericarps or leafy vegetables, mostly has the highest level of the metals which could be attributed to atmospheric deposition in addition to absorption from the soil.

Keywords - Environment, Fruits, Heavy metal, Pollution, Soil, Vegetable.

1. INTRODUCTION

Consumption of vegetables and fruits as food offers the most rapid and lowest cost means of providing adequate supplies of vitamins, minerals and fiber to the body. Vegetables are the leafy outgrowth of plants used as food and include those plants and parts of plants used in making soups or served as integral parts of the main sources of a meal [1]. Some vegetables and fruits have been noted to contain quite reasonable levels of proteins, carbohydrates and fats, which are often needed nutrients for a healthy, balanced diet. That is why it is important to grow or purchase fresh vegetables and fruits for consumption along with our daily meals [2]. They are vital to the human diet and in particular provide the well-known and required trace elements and heavy metals. Minor or trace elements are essential for good health if they come from an organic or plant source. In contrast, if they come from an inorganic or metallic source, they become toxic. Various classes of vegetables are grown in many parts of Nigeria, especially the Northeastern part, Borno State in particular, and are heavily cultivated and consumed as food [3].

Vegetables play important roles in our daily diet as economic crops. They constitute our essential diet components (protein, vitamins, iron, calcium and other nutrients), which are usually very scarce or are in short supply [4]. However, they contain both essential and non essential toxic elements at varying concentrations. Various human activities such as mining, industrial processing, vehicular emissions, pesticides and fertilizer application, especially the huge annual applications of organic livestock manure, which is the traditional agricultural fertilizer, are causing elevated heavy metal concentrations in the environment [5, 6]. Absorption and accumulation of these heavy metals in vegetables and fruits are influenced by many factors such as concentration of the metals in soil, atmospheric

deposition, precipitations, and phase of plant vegetation [7]. Accumulation of these metals in vegetables may therefore pose a direct or indirect threat to human health [8, 9].

Vegetables take up metals by absorbing them from contaminated soils, and atmospheric deposits on different parts of the vegetables exposed to the air from polluted environments [10]. It has been reported that nearly half of the mean ingestion of lead, cadmium and mercury for instance, through food is due to plant origin (fruit, vegetables and cereals). Heavy metals, such as cadmium, copper, lead, chromium and mercury, are important environmental pollutants, particularly in areas with high anthropogenic pressure. Chronic intakes of heavy metals have damaging effects on human beings and other animals [11, 12, 13]. For example, Cr, Cu and Zn can cause non-carcinogenic hazardous such as neurologic involvement, headache and liver disease, when they exceed their safe threshold values [14]. Their presence in the atmosphere, soil and water, even in traces, can cause great hazard to all organisms as well as agricultural production due to their adverse effects on food quality (safety and marketability), crop growth (due to phytotoxicity) [15, 16] and environmental health (soil flora/fauna and terrestrial animals).

Heavy metal-contaminated food can seriously deplete some essential nutrients in the body that are further responsible for decreasing immunological defenses, intrauterine growth retardation, impaired psychosocial faculties, disabilities associated with malnutrition and high prevalence of upper gastrointestinal cancer rates [18, 19]. Serious systemic health hazards can develop as a result of extreme dietary accumulation of heavy

metals such as Cr, Cd, Ni and Pb [20]. Food is the major intake source of toxic metals by human beings. Among different food systems, vegetables are the most exposed food to environmental pollution due to aerial burden. Vegetables are consumed enormously in many countries and thus constitute one of the important food sources. It is therefore imperative to assess the level of trace or heavy metals in different varieties of vegetables. The main aim of this paper therefore is to assess the level of some heavy metals contaminants in some fruits and vegetables grown in Gongolon, Jere (one of the main supplier of vegetables) local government area of Borno state, north-eastern part of Nigeria.

2. MATERIL AND METHODS

2.1 Sampling Area

Gongolon irrigation site is located in Jere Local Government Area of Borno State, north eastern part of Nigeria (fig. 1). It is 9.75 Km from Maiduguri Metropolis, has an area of 868km² and a population of 211,204 at the 2006 census [21]. The major crops grown in the area include groundnut, beans, maize, millets etc. vegetables such as lettuce, onion, water-leaf, sorrel etc as well as fruits such as cucumber, tomato, mango, guava etc are also cultivated. Köppen-Geiger climate classification system classifies the climate of this area as hot semi-arid climate. The highest recorded temperature was 47 °C (117 °F) on May 28, 1983, whereas the lowest recorded temperature was 5 °C (41 °F) on December 26, 1979 [22].



Figure 1: Showing the Sampling Area Gongolon

2.2 Sample collection

Bunches of vegetables and fruits samples (lettuce, water-leaf, cucumber, tomato and sorrel) were collected from the sampling site by cutting with stainless knife from the shoot. These were then sliced into pieces, dried in an oven at 105°C to a constant weight, grounded, sieved, packed in a polyethylene bags separately and labeled with a unique identification number. Soil samples were collected from the same sampling site as the vegetables. Soil collection was randomly made at the depth of 0 to 20cm and at the intervals of 20-30 meters apart using spiral auger, these were pulled together to represent a sample from each sampling point [23]. The soil collected were then dried, ground and sieved (using < 2mm nylon sieve) put in a clean plastic bags separately labeled and taken to the laboratory for subsequent analysis. Four different samples were collected monthly for the period of four months (from February to May 2017) to ensure replicate analysis.

2.3 Sample preparation and analysis

One gram (1g) of a well homogenized sample obtained from sample preparation procedure above was weighed into a Kjeldahl flask and 12ml of freshly prepared aqua regia (3ml HNO₃ + 9ml HCl i.e. ratio 1:3) was added. Then covered and heated for two hours on medium heat of a hot plate. The mixture was allowed to cool and then filtered through a Whatman No. 42 filter paper into a 50ml standard volumetric flask. The filtrate was diluted to 50ml with deionized water. The digested samples were then filtered and the volume of the filtrate was adjusted to 100 cm³ with distilled water. Physiochemical properties of the soil were determined and the heavy metals; arsenic, cadmium, chromium, nickel, lead, selenium and zinc were determined using Atomic Absorption Spectroscopy (AAS) [23].

3. DATA HANDLING

All statistical analyses were performed using SPSS 17 package. Differences in heavy metal concentrations among the samples were detected using One-way ANOVA, followed by multiple comparisons using Turkey tests. A significance level of (P< 0.05) was used throughout the study.

4. RESULTS

Physiochemical Properties of the Soil

The taxonomic classification of the soil from the sampling site indicates that, the soil is sandy. It has less organic matter content of 1.170µg/g which shows that, it is also not rich in humus for that it is less fertile for plant growth. It therefore requires enhancement through fertilizer, manure or sewage application. The soil was found slightly acidic with the pH value of 6.468. The observed pH level of the soils is generally within the range for soil in the region. Soil pH plays an important role in the sorption of heavy metals. It controls the solubility and hydrolysis of metal hydroxides, carbonates and phosphates. It also influences ion-pair formation, solubility of organic matter, as well as surface charge of Fe, Mn and Al-oxides, organic matter and clay edges [24]. The electrical conductivity (EC) was observed to be 0.224 mS/cm whereas the CEC value was found to be 12.984. Cation Exchange Capacity measures the ability of soils to allow for easy exchange of cations between its surface and solutions. The relatively low level of clay and CEC indicate high permeability and leachability of metals in the soil from site one.

Table one below shows the distribution of the elements determined in the vegetables and soil that supported their growth. In the soil, Ni has the highest level of 0.357µg/g followed by Pb (0.350 µg/g. Chromium (Cr) has 0.315 µg/g and lowest level was observed for Zn (0.174 µg/g). In the vegetables, Zn has the highest level of 2.202 µg/g observed in tomato, 2.118 µg/g in sorrel, and 1.330 µg/g observed in cucumber. The lower levels; 0.719, 0.777, 0.804, and 0.854µg/g were observed in onion, water melon, lettuce, and guava respectively. The highest level of Cr (1.048 µg/) was observed in guava, whereas 1.015 µg/g was observed in cucumber. The lower levels of 0.073, 0.275, 0.429, 0.508, and 0.571µg/g in ascending order were observed in sorrel, lettuce, water melon, onion, and tomato respectively. The observed values for Ni range from 0.090 in sorrel to 0.980µg/g in guava whereas for Pb the values were found ranging from 0.054 in sorrel to 0.363µg/g in cucumber (Table 1).

Table 1: Mean Concentration ($\mu\text{g/g}$) of the Heavy Metals; Cr, Ni, Pb, and Zn, determined in the soil and the vegetables grown on the soil of this study

Samples Elements	Tom	Cuc	Gua	Let	Wtm	Oni	Sor	Soil
As	0.025 ± 0.013	0.043 ± 0.010	0.025 ± 0.013	0.038 ± 0.015	0.030 ± 0.008	0.018 ± 0.010	0.020 ± 0.008	0.300 ± 0.014
Cd	0.630 ± 0.159	0.700 ± 0.553	Nd	0.440 ± 0.199	Nd	Nd	0.107 ± 0.048	Nd
Cr	0.571 ± 0.079	Nd	Nd	0.275 ± 0.294	Nd	0.508 ± 0.304	0.073 ± 0.583	0.357 ± 0.205
Ni	0.351 ± 0.181	Nd	Nd	0.275 ± 0.114	Nd	0.365 ± 0.320	Nd	0.350 ± 0.105
Pb	0.150 ± 0.117	Nd	Nd	Nd	Nd	0.141 ± 0.036	Nd	0.228 ± 0.075
Zn	2.202 ± 0.086	1.330 ± 0.060	0.854 ± 0.080	0.804 ± 0.017	0.776 ± 0.094	0.719 ± 0.171	2.118 ± 0.054	0.174 ± 0.390
Se	0.504 ± 0.316	0.430 ± 0.193	0.625 ± 0.127	0.653 ± 0.100	0.326 ± 0.017	0.353 ± 0.053	0.432 ± 0.104	0.556 ± 0.069

Data are presented in mean \pm SD ($n = 4$). No significant difference was observed among the means at ($P = 0.05$) according to Turkey test. SD = Standard Deviation, Nd Not detected, Tom = tomato, Cuc = Cucumber, Gua = Guava, Let = Lettuce, Wtm = Water melon, Oni = Onion, and Sor = Sorrel

5. DISCUSSION

5.1 Zinc

Among all the heavy metals, Zinc is the least toxic and an essential element in human diet as it is required for the proper maintenance of the body functions. For example, the immune system, proper brain functioning and is vital for the development of fetal growth. Deficiency of Zn in the diet may be more dangerous to living organism including human than its high concentration in the diet. The recommended dietary allowance for Zinc is 15mg/day for men and 12mg/day for Women [25]. It is therefore an essential element for plants and animals; however, a small increase in the required level may cause interference with physiological processes. In this study, high concentration of zinc was observed in tomato (2.202 $\mu\text{g/g}$), sorrel (2.118 $\mu\text{g/g}$), and the level 1.330 $\mu\text{g/g}$ in cucumber. However, the levels observed for tomato, sorrel and onion in this study (Table 1) were found lower than (8.427 $\mu\text{g/g}$) in tomato and (9.650 $\mu\text{g/g}$) in onion in a study conducted in Misurata [26]. It is also many-folds lower than what was found in tomato and onion [27]. However, the levels observed for Zn in this study were very much greater than 0.55 and 0.15 $\mu\text{g/g}$ determined in tomato and cucumber respectively in a study from Hyderabad [28]. The lower levels of 0.719 and 0.777 $\mu\text{g/g}$ for Zn, observed in onion and water melon respectively were found lower than 5.110 and 11.400 $\mu\text{g/g}$ as observed in Misurata [26] but higher

than 0.34 $\mu\text{g/g}$ observed in onion from Hyderabad [28]. Zinc is reported as a coenzyme for over 200 enzymes involved in immunity, new cells growth, acid base regulation etc. Lack of sufficient amount of Zn results in reduced activity of related enzymes e.g. carbonic anhydrase [29]. According to ATSRD, [30] the daily intake limit of Zn is up to 15 mg/day. Data related to Zn toxicity is very rare [31]. It has been reported that Zn is more actively mobilize than Cu from roots to shoots [32]. The level of Zn observed in vegetable samples of this study is however much lower than the [33] safe limit of 99.40mg/kg which indicates the safety of the vegetables.

5.2 Nickel

Nickel plays its role as a coenzyme in different enzymes. Deficiency of Ni can lead to increased blood sugar level, hypertension and deficient growth in human but increased uptake of Ni in fruits and vegetables can reduced the blood glucose level, difficulty in breathing, nausea etc. According to ATSDR [34] the acceptable range of Ni daily intake is 3-7 mg/day. Ni is one of the essential element which is present in the environment in trace amount as well as it is considered as indispensable for number of metabolic reactions in living beings [35]. Ni is usually accumulated in vegetative part of the plant body and it is mobile through the plant structure, translocated and concentrated in the leaves but after ageingness of the leaves it is moved to the seeds for accumulation [36].

In this study the highest levels of Ni were found in guava (0.980 $\mu\text{g/g}$), followed by cucumber (0.812 $\mu\text{g/g}$), and onion (0.365 $\mu\text{g/g}$). In contrast, these values were found higher than 0.180 $\mu\text{g/g}$ observed in cucumber, 0.040 $\mu\text{g/g}$ in guava, and 0.006 $\mu\text{g/g}$ in onion reported by Ismail et al. [28]. The levels were also found higher than 0.220 $\mu\text{g/g}$ observed in cucumber and 0.32 $\mu\text{g/g}$ in onion from Misurata, Libya [26]. However, the levels of Ni observed in this study were many-folds lower than what was reported by Singh et al. [37] and Ali and Al-Qahtani, [38]. It is lower than what was observed in onion and tomato from Sharada, Kwakwaci and Jakara in Kano State Nigeria [27]. The increased concentrations of Ni are probably to a large extent the consequence of atmospheric deposition of particles. Generally, nickel and its salts do not affect the human body but in some cases it has been recorded to cause allergic problems as it comes in contact with moist skin. It also adversely affects the lungs and nasal cavities [39]. However, the permissible limit set by [40] in edible plants was 1.63 ppm.

5.3 Chromium

Chromium is present in human tissues in variable concentrations and its deficiency is characterized by disturbance in glucose, lipid and protein metabolism [41]. It is an element occurring in food products of both plant and animal origins. It is regarded as an essential trace element in humans and animals, taking part in various metabolic processes. As an element, it has been reported that it is usually present in food in the trivalent form; the hexavalent form of it however, is toxic and not normally found in food [42]. It has been reported to cause skin rashes, stomach ulcer, kidney, liver damages, lungs cancer and ultimate death [39]. Chromium (VI) can easily penetrate the cell wall and exert its noxious influence in the cell itself, being also a source of various cancer diseases [43]. It has been reported that the daily dietary intake of 0.05-0.2 mg of chromium contributes to well being of the human. The permissible limit set by [40] in edible plants was 0.02 ppm. In this study the highest level of chromium (0.571 $\mu\text{g/g}$) was observed in tomato followed by onion (0.508 $\mu\text{g/g}$). These levels were found lower than what was observed in both tomato and onion in Karaci city [44]. It is however higher than what was reported from Thomas dam Kano [28].

5.4 Lead

Lead is a serious cumulative body poison which enters into the body system through air, water and food and cannot be removed by washing fruits and vegetables [45]. Lead in some plants may probably be attributed to pollutants in irrigation water, soil or due to pollution from the highways traffic [46]. In many plants, Pb

accumulation can exceed several hundred times the threshold of maximum level permissible for human consumption [47]. The contamination of agricultural soils is often a direct or indirect consequence of anthropogenic activities [48]. Trace elements are the natural constituents of the soil and due the variation in atmospheric condition their plant uptake equally varies through root to the shoot [49]. Other sources of anthropogenic contamination include the addition of manures, sewage sludge, fertilizers and pesticides to soils, with a number of studies identifying the risks in relation to increased soil metal concentration and consequent crop uptake [50, 51]. In this study, the level of lead (0.150 $\mu\text{g/g}$, and 0.141 $\mu\text{g/g}$ observed in tomato and in onion were found very much lower than what was observed in tomato (6.00 $\mu\text{g/g}$) and 17.00 $\mu\text{g/g}$ in onion [37]. The levels of this study were also lower than what was reported from Sharada, Kwakwaci and Jakara in Kano State, Nigeria [27] and from Saudi Arabian market [38]. Both commercial and residential growing areas are also subject to atmospheric pollution, in the form of metal containing aerosols. These aerosols can enter the soil and be absorbed by vegetables, or alternatively be deposited on leaves and adsorbed. The levels observed however, in this study, were lower than the WHO safe limit of 2.0 mg kg^{-1} [52].

5.5 Selenium

Selenium (Se) is an essential micronutrient, necessary for normal function of human and animal physiology. It is incorporated into proteins to make selenoproteins, which are important antioxidant enzymes, vitamins, hormones and other protein tissues which help prevent cellular damage from free radicals resulting from oxygen metabolism. The absences of these antioxidants help contribute to the development of some chronic diseases and play a role in the depression of the immune system [53, 54]. It has been reported that, the deficiency of selenium in food and feed causes a number of diseases like cancer, cardiomyopathy, myocardial deaths, arthritis, rheumatoid and myxedematous endemic cretinism [55, 56]. Se deficiency has also been implicated in the progression of Human Immune Deficiency Syndrome (HIV) infection to full blown Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome (AIDS) [57, 58]. Selenium is toxic in large amounts, but trace amounts of it are necessary for cellular function. Short-term oral exposure to high concentrations can cause nausea, vomiting, and diarrhea. Major signs of selenosis are hair loss, nail brittle-ness, and neurological abnormalities. Brief exposures to high levels in air can result in respiratory tract irritation, bronchitis, difficulty breathing, and stomach pains. Longer-term

exposure can cause respiratory irritation, bronchial spasms, and coughing [59].

Although there is little evidence that selenium is essential for vegetation growth, it is incorporated into the plant structure. Selenium concentrations in plants generally reflect the levels of selenium in the environment such that the same plant species grown over high and low selenium-available soils will contain concentrations reflecting the soil composition. However, an important factor that may determine whether or not selenium-related health problems manifest in animals and humans is the very wide-ranging ability of different plant species to accumulate selenium [60, 61, 62]. Plant foods are the major dietary sources of selenium in most countries of the world and the content of selenium in these food sources depends on the selenium content of the soil where they are grown [63, 64]. When we feed on plants and animals that had absorbed a large quantity of Se, selenium level will tend to increase in our systems. Selenium (Se) is a naturally occurring metalloid element, which is essential to human and other animal health in trace amounts but is harmful in excess. Of all the elements, selenium has one of the narrowest ranges between dietary deficiency ($<40 \mu\text{gday}^{-1}$) and toxic levels ($>400\mu\text{gday}^{-1}$) [65], which makes it necessary to carefully control intakes by humans and other animals, hence, the importance of understanding the relationships between environmental exposure and health.

5.6 Arsenic

Arsenic is regarded as human carcinogen from extremely low levels of exposure, having no possible beneficial metabolic functions for humans [66]. Its low level exposure cause nausea and vomiting decreased production of RBCs and WBCs, abdominal pain and its long term exposure causes darkening of skin and appearance of small corns on palm soles. Other affect includes abnormal ECG, anorexia, fever, fluid loss, goitre, hair loss, headache, herpes, im-paired healing, jaundice, keratosis, kidney and liver damage, muscle spasms, pallor, peripheral neuritis, sore throat, weakness and interferes with the uptake of folic acid [66]. Arsenic is extremely toxic. The concentration of arsenic exceeding the maximum permissible limit ($0.03 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$) in foodstuff [67] cause short term (nausea, vomiting, diarrhea, weakness, and loss of appetite, cough and headache) and long term (cardiovascular diseases, diabetes and vascular diseases) health effects [68]. In this study, the level of Arsenic ranges from 0.018-0.043 $\mu\text{g g}^{-1}$. The element was observed in all the vegetables. The highest level however was found in Cucumber ($0.043 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$) followed by lettuce ($0.038 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$), the least of which was observed in onion ($0.018 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$). The highest level of Arsenic observed in

cucumber of this study is in agreement with was observed in cucumber ($0.043 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$) from Pakistan [68]. The least level of arsenic observed in onion ($0.018 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$) of this study was found many-folds lower than what was observed in onion ($0.82 \mu\text{g g}^{-1}$) from Kola village [69]

5.7 Cadmium

Cadmium is a heavy metal naturally present in soils. It may also be added to the soil as a contaminant in fertilizer, manure, sewage sludge and from aerial deposition. The amount of cadmium contributed from each source varies with location due to differences in soil formation, management practices and exposure to pollution sources, but the level of Cd in the soil appears to be increasing over time [70]. Although plants do not require Cd for growth or reproduction, the bioaccumulation index of Cd in green plants exceeds that of all other trace elements [71]. Plants can accumulate relatively high levels of cadmium, without adverse effects on growth [72]. Cadmium is retained for many years in the human body, so consumption of foods high in Cd may induce chronic toxicity [73]. The World Health Organization set a maximum provisional tolerable intake limit for an adult at 60 to 70 $\mu\text{g Cd}$ per day [74] and the Codex Alimentarius Commission of FAO/WHO is discussing a limit of 0.1 $\mu\text{g/g}$. Vast areas of crop land can be considered to be uncontaminated or only slightly contaminated with Cd from phosphate fertilizer, manure and aerial deposition. Under such conditions, some crops such as durum wheat, flax, sunflowers and potatoes can accumulate amounts of Cd which exceed current and proposed maximum acceptable Cd concentrations. Uptake of Cd by the plant increases with increasing concentration of Cd in the soil solution and is influenced by the size and uptake characteristics of the plant root system [75]. Therefore, Cadmium accumulation in crops is a function of the complex interaction of soil, plant and environmental factors which influence Cd phytoavailability. In this study, the highest level of Cadmium ($0.700 \mu\text{g/g}$) was observed in Cucumber followed by lettuce ($0.44 \mu\text{g/g}$) the least of which was observed in sorrel ($0.107 \mu\text{g/g}$) as shown in Table one above. Cadmium in this study was found not detectable in guava, white melon and onion. The level observed in lettuce of this study was higher than what was observed in lettuce from Boolaro ($0.213 \mu\text{g/g}$), Sydney basin ($0.015 \mu\text{g/g}$) and port Kemla ($0.060 \mu\text{g/g}$) [76]. Although has been reported that, leafy vegetables accumulate higher metal contents than others [77]. It has also been reported that, concentrations of Cd in vegetables grown in uncontaminated soils generally varied from 0.005 to 0.5 $\mu\text{g/g}$, with levels being somewhat higher in leafy vegetables and in belowground tissues than in other

plant tissues [78]. Cadmium level observed in cucumber of this study was also higher than what reported by [26] from Misurata area of Libya. However, the level of cadmium determined in vegetables of this study was very much lower than was observed in vegetables from upstream (1.014 $\mu\text{g/g}$) and downstream (2.120 $\mu\text{g/g}$) from Kaduna state Nigeria [79]. Cadmium was however not detected in cucumber and lettuce in study from Jos-North [80]. It can therefore be concluded that our estimated daily intakes for the heavy metals studied here are below those reported by the FAO/WHO, which have set a PTDI limit for the heavy metal intake based on body weight for an average adult (60 kg body weight) for Pb, Cd, Cu, and Zn as 214 μg , 60 μg , 3 mg, and 60 mg, respectively [67]. The maximum permissible limit ($0.1\mu\text{g}\cdot\text{g}^{-1}$) in foodstuff for cadmium has been reported [67]

6. CONCLUSION

From this study, it can be concluded that, the vegetables from Gongolon irrigation site is safe for consumption with the exception of Pb, Cd and to some extent Cr and Ni in tomato, lettuce, onion and sorrel that indicates above maximum permissible limits, this could be due to atmospheric deposits. Generally, the variation in the levels of the metals could be attributed mostly to atmospheric deposition and the variety of the fruits or vegetable. Most fruits with hard pericarp had less level of the metals, the source of which therefore could be the soil. Those with soft pericarps or leafy vegetables, mostly has the highest levels of the metals which could be attributed to atmospheric deposition in addition to absorption from the soil. Based on FAO/WHO safe limit data, cucumber is maximally contaminated with Cd followed by tomato and lettuce. The study suggests that washing technique can be used as a tool to assess the heavy metals load in vegetables through atmospheric depositions. This study further suggested that to reduce the health risk, vegetables should be washed properly before consumption as washing can remove a significant amount of aerial contamination from the vegetable surface.

REFERENCE

[1]. A. I. Ihekoronye, and P. O. Ngoddy, *Integrated Food Science and Technology for the Tropics*. Macmillan Education Ltd, Oxford, London, 1985. Pp. 257–281

[2]. F. T. Moran, *Success in Vegetable and fruit Production*, Londman Zimbabwe. 1996, 1-6

[3]. M. H. Bukhari and M. S. Ahmed, *Food Plants in Borno State, Nigeria*, Ghulandi Publishers, Lahore, 1985, pp. 1-46.

[4]. H. C. Thompson, and W. C. Kelly. *Vegetable crops*. New Delhi: McGraw Hill Publishing Company 1990.

[5]. H. B. Cao, J. J. Chen, J. Zhang, H. Zhang, L. Qiao, and Y. Men, Heavy metals in rice and garden vegetables and their potential health risks to inhabitants in the vicinity of an industrial zone in Jiangsu, China. *Journal of Environmental Science*, 22(11), 2010, 1792–9.

[6]. N. Zheng, Q. C. Wang, D. M. Zheng, Health risk of Hg, Pb, Cd, Zn, and Cu to the inhabitants around Huludao Zinc Plant in China via consumption of vegetables. *Science Total Environment*, 383, 2007, 81–9.

[7]. D. Vontsa, A. Grimanis, C. Samara, Trace elements in vegetables grown in industrial areas in relation to soil and air particulate matter, *Environmental Pollution*, 94, 1996, 325-335.

[8]. M. K. Türkdogan, F. Kilicel, K. Kara, I. Tuncer and I. Uygan, Heavy metals in soil, vegetables and fruit in the endemic upper gastrointestinal cancer region of Turkey. *Environmental Toxicological Pharmacology*. 13(3), 2003, 175–179.

[9]. M. Damek-Poprawa and K. Sawicka-Kapusta, Damage of the liver, kidney and testis with reference to burden of heavy metals in yellow-necked mice from areas around steelworks and zinc smelters in Poland. *Toxicology*, 186, 2003, 1-10.

[10]. G. Zurera-Cosano, R. Moreno-Rojas, J. Salmeron-Egea, and R. P. Lora, Heavy metal uptake from greenhouse border soils for edible vegetables, *Journal of the Science of Food and Agriculture*, 49(3), 1989, 307-314

[11]. N. Zheng, J. Liu, Q. Wang, Z. Liang, Health risk assessment of heavy metal exposure to street dust in the zinc smelting district, northeast of China. *Science Total Environment*, 408, 2010, 726–33.

[12]. H. Y. Lai, Z. Y. Hseu, T. C. Chen, B. C. Chen, H. Y. Guo and Z. S. Chen, Health risk-based assessment and management of heavy metals-contaminated soil sites in Taiwan. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*, 7, 2010, 3595–614.

[13]. G. F. John, and B. Andrew, A lead isotopic study of the human bioaccessibility of lead in urban soils from Glasgow, Scotland. *Science Total Environment*, 409, 2011, 4958–65.

[14]. US EPA. Supplementary guidance for conducting health risk assessment of chemical mixtures, Risk Assessment Forum Technical Panel; 2000 [EPA/630/R-00/002].

[15]. Q. Y. Ma, S. J. Traina and T. J. Logan, Effect of aqueous Al, Cd, Fe(II), Ni and Zn on Pb immobilization by hydroxyapatite. *Environmental Science & Technology* 28(7), 1994, 1219–1228.

- [16]. J. J. Msaky, and R. Calvert, Adsorption behavior of copper and zinc in soils: influence of pH on adsorption characteristics. *Soil Science*, 150(2), 1990, 513–522.
- [17]. J. E. Fergusson, *The Heavy Elements: Chemistry, Environmental Impact and Health Effects*. Pergamon Press, Oxford, 1990, P. 614.
- [18]. V. Iyengar, and P. Nair, Global outlook on nutrition and the environment: meeting the challenges of the next millennium. *Science of the Total Environment*, 249, 2000, 331–346.
- [19]. M. Arora, B. Kiran, S. Rani, A. Rani, B. Kaur, and N. Mittal, Heavy metal accumulation in vegetables irrigated with water from different sources. *Food Chemistry* 111, 2008, 811–815.
- [20]. M. A. Oliver, Soil and human health: a review. *European Journal of Soil Science* 48, 1997, 573–592.
- [21]. H. M. Mukhtar, Nitrate in Vegetables. Toxicity Content, Intake and EC Regulation, *Journal of the Science of Food and Agriculture*, 86, 2007, 10-17
- [22]. O. Aborisade, and R. J. Mundt, The development and preservation of Nigerian languages. *Posnaniensia: international review of English Studies*, 173(8), 2002, 639-646.
- [23]. M. Radojevic, V. Bashin, *Practical Environmental Analysis*, Royal Society of Chemistry, Cambridge, UK. 1999, PP. 356-377, 400-408.
- [24]. S. Tokalioglu, S. Kartal and A. Gültekin, Investigation of heavy-metal uptake by vegetables growing in contaminated soils using the modified BCR sequential extraction method. *International journal of environmental analytical chemistry.*, 86 (6), 2006, 417-430
- [25]. M. W. Ogunlesi, L. Okiei, V. Azeez, M. Obakachi, G. N. Osunsanmi, Vitamin Contents of Tropical Vegetables and Foods determined by Voltammetric and Titrimetric Methods and Their Relevance to the medicinal uses of the plants. *International Journal of Electrochemical Science*, 5, 2010, 105-115
- [26]. M. A. Elbagermi, H. G. M. Edwards and A. I. Alajtal, Monitoring of Heavy Metal Content in Fruits and Vegetables Collected from Production and Market Sites in the Misurata Area of Libya. *International Scholarly Research Network ISRN Analytical Chemistry*, 2012, pp.1- 5 doi:10.5402/2012/827645
- [27]. A. O. Lawal, and A. A. Audu, Analysis of heavy metals found in vegetables from some cultivated irrigated gardens in the Kano metropolis, Nigeria, *Journal of Environmental Chemistry and Ecotoxicology* Vol. 3(6), 2011, 142-148.
- [28]. F. Ismail, M. R. Anjum, A. N. Mamon and T. G. Kazi, Trace Metal Contents of Vegetables and Fruits of Hyderabad Retail Market. *Pakistan Journal of Nutrition*, 10 (4), 2011, 365-372,
- [29]. Stephanie Strachan, Points of View: Nutrition, Trace elements current Anaesthesia and critical care, 21, 2010, 44 - 4
- [30]. Agency for Toxic Substances and Disease Registry (ATSDR), *Toxicological Profile for Zinc and Cobalt*. US Department of Health and Human Services, Public Health Service, Contact No. 205-88-0608. 1994.
- [31]. A. O. Barone, O. Ebesh and R.G. Harper, Placental copper transport in rats: Effects of elevated dietary zinc on fetal copper, iron and metallothionein. *Journal of Nutrition*, 128, 1990, 1037-1041.
- [32]. S. A. S. Barrg, and S. C. Clark, Problems of interpreting the relationship between the amounts of lead and Zinc in plants and soil on metalliferous wastes. *New Phytol.*, 81, 1998, 773-783.
- [33]. FAO/WHO, Codex Alimentarius Commission (2001). Food Additives and Contaminations. Joint FAO/WHO Food Standards programme, ALINORM 01/12A:1- 289
- [34]. ATSDR, *Toxicological Profile for Cadmium and Nickel*. Atlanta, Georgia, United States. US Department of Health and Human Services. Agency for Toxic Substances and Disease Registry. 1999.
- [35]. P. H. Brown, R. M. Welch, and E. E. Cary, Nickel: A Micronutrients essential for higher Plants. *Plant Physiology*, 85, 1997, 801-803
- [36]. D. A. Cataldo, T. R. Garland and R. E. Wildung, Nickel in plants. *Plant Physiology*. 62, 1978, 563-570
- [37]. S. Singh, M. Zacharias, S. Kalpana, and S. Mishra, Heavy metals accumulation and distribution pattern in different vegetable crops. *Journal of Environmental Chemistry and Ecotoxicology* Vol. 4(10), 2012, pp. 170-177.
- [38]. M. H. H. Ali and K. M. Al-Qahtani, Assessment of some heavy metals in vegetables, cereals and fruits in Saudi Arabian markets. *Egyptian Journal of Aquatic Research* 38, 2012, 31–37
- [39]. M. Z. Kirmani, S. Sheikh Mohiuddin, F. Naz, I. I. Naqvi and E. Zahir, Determination of some toxic and essential trace metals in some medicinal and edible plants of Karachi city Pakistan, *Journal of Basic and Applied Sciences*, Vol. 7, No. 2, 2011, pp. 89-95.
- [40]. FAO/WHO, 1984. Contaminants. In Codex Alimentarius, Vol. XVII, Edition 1. FAO/WHO. Codex Alimentarius Commission, Rome.
- [41]. M. Schumacher, J. L. Domingo, J.M. Llobet and J. Cobella, Chromium copper and zinc concentrations in edible vegetables grown in tarragona province Spain. *Ull. Environmental Contamination and Toxicology*, 50, 1993, 514-521.
- [42]. L. Noël, J. C. Leblanc, T. Guérin, Determination of several elements in duplicate meals from catering establishments using closed vessel microwave digestion with inductively coupled plasma mass spectrometry detection: estimation of daily dietary

intake. *Food Additives & Contaminants*, 20, 2003, 44–56.

[43]. United State Environmental Protection Agency, *Toxicological review of trivalent chromium (CAS no. 16065-83-1) in support of summary information on the integrated risk information system (IRIS)*, US Environmental Protection Agency, Washington, DC, 1998.

[44]. D. R. Hashmi, F. R. Khan, G. H. Shaikh and T. H. Usman (2005). Determination of Trace Metals in the Vegetables Procured from Markets of Karachi city by Atomic Absorption Spectrophotometer. *Journal of the Chemical Society of Pakistan*, Vol. 27, No. 4, 2005, 353-357.

[45]. F. Itanna, Metals in leafy vegetables grown in Addis Ababa and toxicological implications. *Ethiopian Journal of Health Development*, 16(3), 2002, 295-302

[46]. M. K. Ladipo and V. F. Doherty, Heavy Metals Levels in Vegetables from selected Markets in Lagos, Nigeria. *African Journal of Food Science and Technology*. 2(1), 2011, 018-021

[47]. F. Muhammad, A. Farooq and R. Umer, Appraisal of Heavy Metal Contents in different Vegetables grown in the Vicinity of an Industrial Area. *Pakistan Journal of Botany*, 40(5), 2008, 2099-2106

[48]. M. J. McLaughlin, D. R. Parker and J. M. Clarke 'Metals and micronutrients – food safety issues', *Field Crops Research*, 60, 1999, 143–163.

[49]. B. Freedman and T.C. Hutchinson, Pollutant inputs from the atmosphere in soils and vegetation near a nickel, copper smelter at Sudburg, Canada. *Canadian journal of botany*, 58, 1980, 108-132

[50]. M. S. Whatmuff, 'Applying biosolids to acid soil in New SouthWales: Are guideline soil metal limits from other countries appropriate?', *Australian Journal of Soil Research*, 40, 2002, 1041–1056.

[51]. M. B. McBride, 'Toxic metals in sewage sludge-amended soils: has promotion of beneficial use discounted the risks?', *Advances in Environmental Research*, 8, 2003, 5–19

[52]. M. Muchuweti, J. W. Birkett, E. Chinyanga, R. Zvauya, M. D. Scrimshaw, J. N. Lester, Heavy metal content of vegetables irrigated with mixtures of wastewater and sewage sludge in Zimbabwe: Implications for human health. *Agriculture, Ecosystems & Environment* 112, 2006, 41–48.

[53]. G.F. Combs. Food System-Based Approaches to Improving Micronutrient Nutrition: The Case for Selenium. *Biofactors*, 12, 2000, 39-43.

[54]. C.G. Fragra. "Relevance, Essentiality and Toxicity of Trace Elements in Human Health", *Molecular Aspects of Medicine*, 26, 2005, 235-244.

[55]. M. P. Rayman. The Importance of Selenium to Human Health. *Lancet*, 356, 2000, 233-241.

[56]. F. Kosar, I. Sahin, H. Taskapan and S. Cehreli, Trace Element Status (Se, Zn, and Cu) in Heart Failure. *Anadolu Kardiol Derg.* 6, 2006, 216-220.

[57]. M. A. Beck, O. A. Levander, and J. Handy, Selenium Deficiency and Viral Infection. *Journal of nutrition*, 133, 2003, 1463-1467.

[58]. S. Shao, and B. Zheng, The Biochemistry of Selenium in Sunan Grassland, Guansu, Northwest China, casts Doubt on 'The Belief that Marco Polo Reported Selenosis for the first time in History' *Environmental Geochemistry and Health*. 30(4), 2008, 307-314.

[59]. H. Kabata and A. Pendias, *Trace Elements in Soil and Plants*, 2nd Edn., Boca Boca Raton FL, USA, 365, Lewis, 1993

[60]. World Health Organization. (1987). *Environmental Health Criterion 58—Selenium*, World Health Organization, Geneva.

[61]. L. W. Jacobs, (Ed.) (1989). *Selenium in Agriculture and the Environment*, Soil Science Society of America Special Publication 23, SSSA, Madison, WI.

[62]. R. H. Neal, Selenium. In *Heavy Metals in Soils* (B. J. Alloway, Ed.), Blackie Academic & Professional, London, 1995, pp. 260–283.

[63]. M. P. Longnecker, P. R. Taylor, O.A. Levander, M. Howe, C. V eillon, P. A. McAdam, K. Y. Patterson, J. M. Holden, M. J. Stampfer, J. S. Morris, and W. C. Willett, Selenium in Diet, Blood, and Toenails in Relation to Human Health in a Seleniferous Area. *American Journal of Clinical Nutrition*, 53, 1991, 1288-94.

[64]. H. F. Li, S. P. McGrath, and F. J. Zhao, Selenium uptake, translocation and speciation in wheat supplied with selenate or selenite. *New Phytologist*, 178(1), 2008, pp.92-102.

[65]. World Health Organization. (1996). *Trace Elements in Human Nutrition and Health*, World Health Organization, Geneva.

[66]. NAS/NRC(National Academy of Sciences/National Research Council). Arsenic in drinking water. Washington, DC. pp. 251-257(1999)

[67]. Joint FAO/WHO Expert Committee on Food Additives, "Summary and conclusions," in Proceedings of the 53rd Meeting Joint FAO/WHO Expert Committee on Food Additives, Rome, Italy, June 1999.

[68]. M. Abbas, Z. Parveen, M. Iqbal, and Riazuddin, et al., Monitoring Of Toxic Metals (Cadmium, Lead, Arsenic and Mercury) In Vegetables Of Sindh, Pakistan, Kathmandu University, *Journal Of Science, Engineering And Technology*, Vol. 6, No. II, 2010, Pp 60-65

[69] T. F. Duressa and S. Leta, Determination of Levels of As, Cd, Cr, Hg and Pb in Soils and Some Vegetables Taken from River Mojo Water Irrigated

Farmland at Koka Village, Oromia State, East Ethiopia
International Journal of Sciences: Basic and Applied
Research (IJSBAR) (2015) Volume 21, No 2, 2015, pp
352-372

[70]. K. C. Jones, A. Jackson, and A. E. Johnston,
Evidence for an increase in the Cd content of herbage
since 1860's. *Environmental Science and Technology*,
26, 1992, 834–836.

[71]. A. Kabata-Pendias and H. Pendias, *Trace
elements in soils and plants*. Chpt. 5. CRC Press, Boca
Raton, FL. 1992.

[72]. T. Kuboi, A. Noguchi, and J. Yazaki, Family-
dependent cadmium accumulation characteristics in
higher plants. *Plant Soil* 92, 1986, 405–415.

[73] A. P. Jackson, and B. J. Alloway, *The transfer of
cadmium from agricultural soils to the human food
chain*. Pages 109–158 in D. C. Adriano, ed.
Biogeochemistry of trace metals. Lewis Publishers,
Boca Raton, FL. 1992.

[74]. World Health Organization. Evaluation of certain
food additives and of the contaminants mercury, lead
and cadmium. FAO Nutrition Meetings Report Series
No. 51. WHO Technical Report Series 505. Food and
Agriculture Organization of the United Nations. Rome.
1972, 33.

[75]. G. L. Mullins, L. E. Sommers and S. A. Barber,
Modelling the plant uptake of cadmium and zinc from

soils treated with sewage sludge. *Soil Science Society
of America Journal*, 50, 1986, 1245–1250.

[76]. A. G. Kachenko and B. Singh, Heavy Metals
Contamination in Vegetables Grown in Urban and
Metal Smelter Contaminated Sites in Australia. *Water,
Air, and Soil Pollution* 169, 2006, 101–123

[77]. M. S. Al Jassir, A. Shaker and M. A. Khaliq,
Deposition of heavy metals on green leafy vegetables
sold on roadsides of Riyadh City, Saudi Arabia.
*Bulletin of Environmental Contamination and
Toxicology*, 75, 2005, 1020-1027.

[78]. H. Avci, Trace metals in vegetables grown with
municipal and industrial wastewaters. *Toxicological &
Environmental Chemistry*, 94, 2012, 1125-1143.

[79] S. A. Mohammed and J. O. Folorunsho, Heavy
metals concentration in soil and Amaranthus
retroflexus grown on irrigated farmlands in the
Makera Area, Kaduna, Nigeria. *Journal of Geography
and Regional Planning*, Vol. 8(8), 2015, pp. 210 – 217

[80]. J. D. Dabak, M. D. Solomon, and S. G. Mafulul,
Comparative Study of Some Heavy and Trace Metals
in Selected Vegetables from four Local Government
Areas of Plateau State, Nigeria. *Journal of
Environmental Science, Toxicology and Food
Technology (IOSR-JESTFT)*, Volume 6, Issue 3, 2013,
PP. 86-93